

**SRS 6907 Saints and Heretics**

**Fall 2019**

**Prof. Emma Anderson**

Wednesdays 8:30-11:30 am, Desmarais 9143

**Office Hours:**

Immediately following class each Wednesday at 11:30 am. I am also available by appointment on Mondays, 1:00-2:00 pm and Thursdays, 2:30-3:30 pm.

Office : 10-112 Desmarais, (613) 562-5800, X1176

Email : eanderso@uottawa.ca

**Course Description:**

*Saints and Heretics* uses the twin lenses of sanctity and dissent to chart seminal shifts in Christian history from its origins to the present in order to better understand how Christian ideals of holiness and experiences of heresy have shifted over the ages. For, even as Christians have long elevated those they believed to be exceptionally holy, they have also condemned, tortured, and executed the “little foxes who spoil the vines:” the theologically heterodox. In some cases, of course, saints and heretics are actually the same individual (such as Joan of Arc, or Thomas More), differently perceived by different Christian groups – seen by some as beloved saints and martyrs, and by others as dangerous, treacherous evildoers.

This course will chart how sanctity has shifted over the ages, from an early, exclusive preoccupation with martyrs to the rise of the saint proper in the aftermath of Roman persecution. Case studies of individual saints will help us to understand the hagiographic “rules” that have been used to construct saints’ lives and “afterlives” (that is, the history of how they are perceived and interpreted, after death, by the living). This course recognizes that saints are the creatures of more than one time: while their historical lives occupy the same modest span of years as any mortal, they can acquire new, subtle, startling, or even deeply contradictory meanings with the passage of time. Over the semester, we will also explore the highly gendered nature of sanctity and chart the evolution of the canonisation process.

In the Middle Ages, arguably the heyday of saints, holy figures played such an important role in popular lay Catholicism that even a “martyred” greyhound could become a popular saint. However, although the cult of saints was officially repudiated by Protestants during the Reformation, holy figures still left a subtle but indelible mark on Reformation thought and practice. Luther, for example, was often seen by his followers as a saintly thumaturge. Protestants’ (apparent) spurning of the saints only increased Catholics’ ardour for these intermediaries between heaven and earth: leading to a Counter-Reformation surge in their popularity. Though embattled during the Enlightenment, saints still continue to perform a critical role in contemporary Catholicism as both exemplars and active intercessors. The course will include a thorough examination of contemporary sanctity, looking at controversial recent and ongoing *causa* (or “saints in the making”). Throughout, the course will highlight the strong sense of personal connection that people have with saints: exploring how ordinary Catholics over the centuries have forged devotional relationships with them through prayer, pilgrimage, vows, and imagery.

Our unveiling of the fascinating history of Christian dissent will permit us a new appreciation of the multiplicity of early Christianity and the persistence of alternative Christianities throughout history: alternatives that can help us to better grasp the distinctiveness of normative, Petrine Christianity. The

Gnostics, for example, had a strikingly different approach to theology, to gender and religious leadership, and to martyrdom than did the mainstream faith. Supposedly familiar saints, such as Mary Magdalene, look strikingly different when viewed from the Gnostic perspective.

Including the realities of disagreement, doctrinal enforcement, and bloody persecution in this course also shows that the *vitae* of many of Christianity's most familiar and popular saints were created through creative opposition to their age's forgotten dissidents. Sanctity has invariably been forged on the whetstone of theological controversy. Saint Dominic made his reputation as the inveterate enemy of Cathar heretics, witches, and Jews, while Saint Louis battled Muslims for control of the Holy Land.

In other cases, it was the image or "idea" of the saint, living or dead, that was held up in order to oppose new, decadent, or evil movements within society, like the figure of Saint Bernadette, the young, illiterate 19<sup>th</sup> century seer at Lourdes whose experiences were seen as repudiating or atoning for the ills of past and present, including the French Revolution and the secularization of French society (or the North American martyrs, who were used during the 1950s as part of a wholesale ideological attack on Soviet Communism).

This course uses a very wide definition of "heresy," so as to allow us to explore the relationship not just between Christian orthodoxy and defiant sects, but with any ideological movement or intellectual development that challenges its dominance in the interpretation of human beings and their place in this world and the next, including scientific challengers of the church.

### **Required Readings:**

To save students money, required readings that are available electronically (either through the website of Morisset Library or on our own course website on Brightspace/Virtual Campus) are **NOT** reproduced in your Course Pack. Moreover, most of the books excerpted in the course packet are also available on Course Reserve at Morisset Library.

The Course Pack for *SRS 6907: Saints and Heretics* is available for purchase at Ryttek Printing, 404 Dalhousie Avenue (phone: 613 241-2679).

### **Extra Readings:**

Students seeking to get a broader overall sense of the sweep of Christian history are encouraged to consult a short reference works such as Mary Jo Weaver and David Brakke's *Introduction to Christianity* (4<sup>th</sup> edition, Wadsworth, 2009) or Diarmaid MacCulloch's magisterial *Christianity: The First Three Thousand Years* (New York: Viking, 2009). Both outline events in Christian history from the time of Jesus to the present. Both are available on Course Reserve at Morisset Library. I have also included specific Suggestions for Further Reading for each class to help students who may have interests in a specific era, saint, or heretic.

### **Student Assignments:**

#### **\* Weekly Response Papers (30%)**

Each week (except for the first and last class) students will prepare a two-page typed Response Paper addressing the Required Readings for that week. The purpose of this exercise is to facilitate students' thinking about the readings in preparation for the class Lecture and Forum. Response Papers should

present students' considered views on the week's material by analytically responding to and critiquing the readings' arguments, analyzing their similarities and differences, and linking the ideas presented therein to other materials studied in or outside the course. At the end of their Response Papers, students should pose several thought-provoking questions for discussion during the Forum.

Students are only required to write nine (9) Response Papers for this twelve (12) week course, so in addition to not writing one the first and last weeks, **students can also skip writing a Response Paper during one other week, at their discretion.** Students must email their weekly Response Paper to the professor and the rest of the class each **Monday at noon at the latest** (so that the Forum Leader for that week has time to prepare his or her comments for our Wednesday AM class). Please, if you are planning to skip the week, email me and your fellow students to let us know!

**\* Leadership of "The Forum" and Forum Participation (20%)**

In addition to the lecture, each week students will engage in a Forum, in which they will discuss the assigned readings for the week. Leadership of the Forum will rotate between students. Forum Leaders will present their own analysis of the topic under consideration and utilize their review of their peers' Response Papers (and the questions posed therein) and lead debate and discussion. Even when students are not the assigned Forum Leader, it is expected that everyone will come to class prepared to engage.

**\* Research Paper (30%).**

Students are advised to begin brainstorming a research paper topic immediately so as to be able to spend the term researching and writing. Please come and see me for approval and suggestions when you have identified a promising topic and provisional bibliography. While it is expected that students will address some aspect of sanctity and heresy during any period of Christian history from Jesus to the present (with studies of individual figures being particularly appropriate) student creativity is encouraged and students' relation of the themes, ideas, and methodologies of the course to their own research focus is encouraged. The Research Paper should be between 20-25 pages, double-spaced (exclusive of front and end matter such as the title page, bibliography, notes, etc.). **Your essay is due the last day of class on Wednesday, December 4, 2019.** Please plan your course work, including research and writing, carefully as I cannot push this deadline back (given my own Faculty deadline for turning in your grades). Because of this deadline, students are not required to write a Response Paper for the final week of class.

**\* Research Presentation (20%).**

Students are also required to make a formal presentation of their Research Project to the class in a 15-20 minute oral presentation. **Where possible, students should endeavor to present their research during the course session that most closely reflects their own research interests, theme, or time period.** Grading will be sensitive to the fact that the presentations made earlier in the semester will, of necessity, reflect more preliminary stages of research.

**\* Field Trips**

This semester will be studded with opportunities outside of class time for students to attend field trips and other events organized by the professor. Field trips will generally take place immediately after class (at 11:30 on Wednesday mornings), wrapping up before students' other commitments commence at 2:30 pm. **Field trips are not mandatory and students will not be graded on their participation in them. However, participation will greatly enhance your experience of the course.** Field trips include a

visit to the National Gallery of Canada and Notre Dame Basilica to explore the iconography of Catholic saints (on Wednesday, September 25), the Historical Site of the Sisters of Charity of Ottawa, to explore the cult of the Venerable Elisabeth Bruyère (on Wednesday, October 23, 2019), and to the Diefenbunker in Carp, Ontario, to experience the creepy, paranoid atmosphere of the Cold War which produced its own distinctive Catholic spirituality (on Wednesday, November 27, I and student volunteers will drive). Every effort will be made to render these field trips free. Students are also invited to attend the public lecture of Canadian novelist and academic Randy Boyagoda, “Bad Catholics make Good Fiction: Faith and Writing Today” (further details to follow).

### Course Outline:

September 4, 2019:

#### **Introduction to SRS 6907/Sanctity and Suffering in Early Christianity**

*Part One:* Overview of the course’s themes, structure, goals, expectations, and assignments, Q & A.

*Part Two:* Introduction to sanctity and dissent in early Christianity. Jesus’ horrifying death forged a compelling model for his followers, that of the martyr. In the face of a renewed Roman crackdown on Jews and other religious dissidents, and in the context of apocalyptic expectations, the early Christian movement lived in a context in which sanctity essentially *was* suffering. Early saints, seeking to emulate their master Jesus but feeling themselves unworthy of the same fate, requested to be crucified upside-down (Peter) or on an X-shaped cross (Andrew). **Please note that, while students are expected to have done the readings, there is no Response Paper due today.**

#### **Required Readings:**

- 1) Paul Middleton, *Martyrdom: A Guide for the Perplexed*. London: T&T Clark, 2011, “Following Jesus the Martyr,” p. 65-76 (in Course Pack).
- 2) Charles Freeman. *Holy Bones, Holy Dust: How Relics Shaped the History of Medieval Europe*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011, “The Incorruptible Flesh of the Martyrs,” p. 15-23 (e-resource available through Morisset Library).
- 3) Lacey Baldwin Smith. *Fools, Martyrs, Traitors: The Story of Martyrdom in the Western World* (New York: Knopf, 1997), “The Early Christian Martyrs: “My Lady” Perpetua,” p. 89-115 (in Course Pack).
- 4) Mary-Ann Stouck, *A Short Reader of Medieval Saints*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009, “The Passion of SS. Perpetua and Felicitas,” p. 9-20 (in Course Pack).

#### **Suggestions for Further Reading:**

- 1) Paul Middleton. *Radical Martyrdom and Cosmic Conflict in Early Christianity*. London: T&T Clark, 2006, “Making Martyrs,” p. 1-14.
- 2) Robin Griffith-Jones. *Beloved Disciple: The Misunderstood Legacy of Mary Magdalene, the Woman Closest to Jesus*. New York: Harper One, 2008, “Not a Christian, but a Christ,” p. 75-90.

September 11, 2019:

#### **From Martyrdom to Asceticism**

Christianity was a religion doubly baptized in blood: firstly, because its central religious narrative celebrated the salvation of the world through salvific death, and secondly because its earliest history was marked by periods of active persecution, which fostered the Christian enshrinement of death over religious dishonor as a crucial marker of their emergent collective identity. As persecution faded, however, Christianity faced something of an identity crisis. Christian asceticism, with its hermetic

isolation and “mortification of the flesh” became, for the professionally religious, an acceptable substitute for martyrdom. With the waning of martyrdom, the larger and more inclusive category of the “saint” began to emerge for the first time. With these changes, attitudes to martyrs began to shift from a desire actively to imitate martyrs to a desire to venerate them. Accordingly, martyrs’ tales became more and more heroic and inimitable.

**Required Readings:**

- 1) Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M Bell, *Saints and Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982, “Chastity,” p. 73-99 (e-resource).
- 2) Jane Schaberg, *The Resurrection of Mary Magdalene: Legends, Apocrypha, and the Christian Testament*. New York: Continuum, 2002, p. 65-81, 100-109 (in Course Pack).
- 3) Aideen Hartney, *Gruesome Deaths and Celibate Lives: Christian Martyrs and Ascetics*. Exeter, UK: Bristol Phoenix Press, 2005, “The Rise of the Holy Person in Late Antiquity,” p. 59-77 (e-resource).
- 4) Mary-Ann Stouck, *A Short Reader of Medieval Saints*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009, “Christianity in the Desert: St. Antony the Great,” p. 21-39 (in Course Pack).

September 18, 2019:

**The Hey-Day of Sanctity: The Middle Ages**

The medieval period represented the high-water mark for Catholics’ engagement with and entreaty of saints. Many of the most crucial beliefs and rituals involving the propitiation and veneration of saints (including the mandated usage of their relics in the altar of each consecrated church, popular pilgrimage to shrines sacred to a particular saint, the association of various saints with various tasks or actions) date from this era. In medieval Europe, the ranks of saints expanded exponentially, often by popular fiat. While nominally controlled by the Vatican, popular saints’ cults were generally the result of lay Catholic engagement with particularly charismatic local figures.

During the Middle Ages, the red ink of saints’ feast days dominated the ritual calendar of the Catholic Church, and the relationship between saint and “client” mimicked in important ways the unequal relationship between vassal and feudal lord. But not all medieval saints were not created equal. In the high middle ages, the meta-saint was the Virgin Mary, whose popularity rivalled (and, in the eyes of critics, threatened) that of her holy son. The rise of Mary also impacted the role of other female saints. Mary’s purity mandated the virginity and chastity of her female imitators, such as Joan of Arc, the virgin warrior. Such was the power of saints that theft of their relics was not at all unusual, and was seen as only being possible with the saint’s permission (or even instigation).

**Required Readings:**

- 1) Marina Warner. *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*. London: Picador, 1990, Chapter Four, “Madonna,” p. 149-159 (in Course Pack).
- 2) John Flower, *Joan of Arc: Icon of Modern Culture*. Hastings, UK: Helm, 2008, Chapter One, “Her Story, Their Story, Whose Version?” p. 5-51 (in Course Pack).
- 3) Patrick Geary, *Furta Sacra: The Theft of Relics in the Central Middle Ages*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1978, “Relics and Saints in the Central Middle Ages,” p. 3-27 (e-resource).
- 4) Emma Anderson, “Who Stole Brother Andre’s Heart?” (available on Course Website).

### ***Suggestions for Further Reading:***

- 1) James Harpur. *The Pilgrim Journey: A History of Pilgrimage in the Western World*. Oxford: Lion Hudson, 2016, especially “Pilgrimage, Relics, and the Afterlife,” p. 65-73 (on Course Reserve).
- 2) Robert A. Scott. *The Gothic Enterprise: A Guide to Understanding the Medieval Cathedral*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2011, especially “Honoring the Dead,” p. 183-208 (on Course Reserve).
- 3) Mary-Ann Stouck, *A Short Reader of Medieval Saints*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009, “Theft of Relics: The Translation of SS. Marcellinus and Peter,” p. 86-106 (on Course Reserve).
- 4) Marina Warner, *Joan of Arc: The Image of Female Heroism*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1981 (on Course Reserve).

*September 25, 2019:*

### **Catholicism, Repression, and Sanctity**

The medieval period witnessed not simply the hey-day of the cult of the saints, but also the growing (and sometimes coercive) power of the Catholic Church across Europe. Some dissident groups nevertheless emerged to challenge Catholic theology and ritual practices, including the popular Cathar movement in France, Italy, and Spain, which defiantly attacked the veneration of saints as unbiblical, even idolatrous. The Catholic Church’s extirpation of the Cathars was the first major internal, European crusade against heresy. Despite being, in part, a haloed land-grab, the venture and featured much of the same extreme language of holy war against the ungodly was simultaneously employed in the crusade against Muslims in the Holy Lands. The campaign against the Cathars also helped to sanctify two figures deeply implicated in its extermination of Catharism: Saint Louis (the crusading king of France) and Saint Dominic, founder of the Dominican order and a leader in the persecution of heretics. It also saw the rise of St. Francis, known during his life and in his early afterlife not principally for “Christian environmentalism” but for his embrace of radical voluntary poverty and his reception of the stigmata (the wounds of Christ).

*After Class:*

### **Field Trip #1: The National Gallery of Canada and Notre Dame Basilica.**

Although slides are frequently used in class, they don’t do true justice to the beauty (and/or horror) or Catholic iconography of the saints, not to the context in which this art was seen. Our visit to the National Gallery of Canada and to Notre Dame Basilica will provide a crash course in saint identification, in the norms of Catholic and Protestant religious art, and in the importance of context in creating religious (or aesthetic) emphasis. Departure immediately after class on foot.

### ***Required Readings:***

- 1) Zoé Oldenbourg, *Massacre at Montségur: A History of the Albigensian Crusade*. London: Phoenix Press, 2000, p. 32-57, 109-121 (in Course Pack).
- 2) Christine Caldwell Ames. *Righteous Persecution: Inquisition, Dominicans, and Christianity in the Middle Ages*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009, Introduction, p. 1-16, “Holy Inquisitors” (selections) p. 57-82, 91-93 (in Course Pack).
- 3) Jacques Le Goff. *Saint Louis*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2009, “The King of the Relics: The Crown of Thorns,” p. 94-101 and “Conflicts and Criticisms” (section, p. 640-655) (in Course Pack).
- 4) Mary-Ann Stouck, *A Short Reader of Medieval Saints*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009, “St. Francis of Assisi: His Conversion and Stigmata,” p. 120-141 (in Course Pack).

***Suggestions for Further Reading:***

- 1) Robert Bartlett, *Why Can the Dead do Such Great Things?* p. 65-71, 174-186, 587-596 (e-resource).
- 2) Patricia Healy Wasylw, *Martyrdom, Murder, and Magic: Child Saints and their Cults in Medieval Europe*. New York, Peter Lang, Chapter 7, "Sacred Passions: William of Norwich and the Origins of the Ritual Murder Accusation," p. 107-120 (e-resource).
- 3) M. C. Gaposchkin, "The Place of the Crusades in the Sanctification of Saint Louis," in Thomas Madden, James Naus, and Vincent Ryan, eds. *Crusades: Medieval Worlds in Conflict*. Farnham, UK: Ashgate, 2010, p. 195-209 (e-resource)

***Optional Readings for the Field Trip:***

Robert Orsi, *Between Heaven and Earth: The Religious Worlds People Make and the Scholars Who Study Them*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2005, "The Many Names of the Mother of God," p. 48-72.

October 2, 2019:

**The Protestant Reformation in Theory and in Practice**

The outbreak of the Protestant Reformation marked a true watershed in the Catholic cult of the saints. Though previously challenged by heterodox groups such as the Cathars, the institution had never faced the systematic attack it now underwent at the hands of Martin Luther and Jean Calvin. Beyond questioning simply the saints, Protestantism questioned the entire edifice on which their cult had been founded: particularly the notion of prayer for the dead and the seemliness of having any other holy intercessor other than Jesus Christ. Ironically, however, given Luther's barbed and often profane attacks on Catholic saints, the work of Robert Scribner has shown that in all likelihood Luther himself was understood as something of a saint by his own Protestant followers.

Protestantism (perceived by the Catholic Church merely as a particularly pernicious and successful heresy) did not content itself with mere verbal criticism: it employed symbolic violence against the material aspects of the Catholic cult of the saints. Through iconoclasm, or the destruction of sacred objects such as statues, relics, stained glass, etc., Protestants sought to demonstrate the inefficacy of such objects. But, in the words of Bruno Latour, "image breakers often become image makers." In the course of their religious rebellion against the Catholic Church, Protestantism developed its own strongly visual religious propaganda.

***Required Readings:***

- 1) Robert Bartlett, *Why Can the Dead do Such Great Things?*, "The Protestant Reformation," p. 85-91 (e-resource).
- 2) Charles Freeman. *Holy Bones, Holy Dust: How Relics Shaped the History of Medieval Europe*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011, p. 219-246 (e-resource).
- 3) Robert Scribner, *Popular Culture and Popular Movements in Reformation Germany*. London: The Hambleton Press, 1987, Chapter 14, "Incombustible Luther: The Image of the Reformer in Early Modern Germany," p. 323-338 (in Course Pack).
- 4) Bruno Latour and Peter Weibel, eds. *Iconoclasm: Beyond the Images Wars in Science, Religion, and Art*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 2002, "The Icon as Iconoclasm," p. 164-193 (in Course Pack).

October 9, 2019:

### **A New “Golden Age” of Martyrdom**

During the Protestant Reformation, in the wake of the blood and fire that Luther’s revolution had unleashed across Europe, the ancient vision of the saint as a martyr or “witness” (through his or her suffering) to the truth of his or her faith regained its earlier popularity within the Protestant movement. Protestants who refused to countenance the notion that saints were the elite friends of God, through whose intercession one might hope to gain favour, readily recognized the legitimacy of the biblical model of the faithful Christian willing to “take up his cross” and endure wrongful trial, torture, and painful death for Christ. But mainstream Protestants’ adoption of the mantle of martyrdom began a tug of war as Catholics, Protestants, and Anabaptists all claimed to be the true martyrs of Christ in their violent interactions with one another. As it had been centuries before, in the Colosseums of the Romans, once again a martyrs’ death was a spectacle, a pious show deliberately performed. The difference was that the martyrs’ crown was now being claimed by rival groups of Christians who, in addition to being themselves subject to persecution by the other groups, also acted as persecutors.

The treacherous political context frequently created situations in which people (perhaps most infamously Thomas More) were forced to choose between their political and religious loyalties. More’s loyalty to the pope and his execution for treason made him a renegade in the eyes of members of the newly formed Anglican Church, but a saint and martyr to Catholics.

A new group of renegades raised issues for both Protestants and Catholics in this era, as the work of Copernicus and Galileo Galilei profoundly questioned earth-centered models of the universe, profoundly challenging the worldview of both Christian confessions.

### **Required Readings:**

- 1) Gregory, Brad. *Salvation at Stake: Christian Martyrdom in Early Modern Europe*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999, selections: Chapter Three, “The Willingness to Kill” (selection), p. 74-82, Chapter Four (selection), “The Willingness to Die,” p. 97-111, “Conclusion: A Shared and Shattered Worldview,” p. 342-352 (in Course Pack).
- 2) Lacey Baldwin Smith, *Fools, Martyrs, Traitors: The Story of Martyrdom in the Western World*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1997, “Sir Thomas More: “A Hero of Selfhood,” p. 149-153, 170-177 (in Course Pack).
- 3) Gary B. Ferngren, ed., *Science and Religion: A Historical Introduction*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2002, p. 95-115 (in Course Pack).
- 4) John King, ed. *Voices of the English Reformation: A Source Book*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004, “Anne Askew, from the Latter Examination,” p. 231-241 (in Course Pack).

**\*\*Please note that due to the Fall Reading Week (October 12-20, 2019) there will be no class on Wednesday, October 16, 2019. Office hours will also be cancelled for the week\*\***

October 23, 2019:

### **The Catholic “Counter-Reformation:” Reaffirming the Faith**

For many Catholics, the full-on attack of Protestant reformers was galvanizing, rather than enervating, ushering in something of a Catholic renaissance often termed “the Counter Reformation.” The dominant response of the Catholic Church was not self-questioning but affirming of its longstanding traditions,



including the veneration of saints. If anything, Catholics stubbornly revered their saints even more precisely *because* they were reviled by Protestants!

Catholics were, like Protestants, profoundly affected by the decades of confessional violence through which both groups lived and turned, like their Protestant counterparts, to the concept (and the recent experience) of martyrdom. Spurred on by the archeological discovery of new catacombs near Rome, European Catholics during the Counter Reformation eagerly imported, decorated, and displayed full skeletons of purported early Christian martyrs in their churches to stress their institution's affiliation with the pure and ancient Christianity of the apostles. But Protestantism also indirectly impacted Catholic thought and practice, transforming it in many big and small ways.

*After Class:*

**Field Trip #2, to the Historical Site of the Sisters of Charity of Ottawa.**

Visiting the Historical Site of the Grey Nuns will allow us to glimpse the enormous energy, commitment, and money that go into religious communities' promotion of their departed members (often founders) as saints by exploring a local case study, that of the Venerable Elisabeth Bruyère. Departure immediately after class on foot. Free admission.

***Required Readings:***

- 1) Charles Freeman. *Holy Bones, Holy Dust: How Relics Shaped the History of Medieval Europe*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011, "Reasserting the Miraculous," p. 254-265 (e-resource)
- 2) Donald Weinstein and Rudolph M Bell, *Saints and Society: The Two Worlds of Western Christendom*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982, "Who Was a Saint?" p. 141-165 (e-resource).
- 3) Erin Rowe, *Saint and Nation: Santiago, Teresa of Avila, and Plural Identities in Early Modern Spain*. University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2011, "Saint Teresa and the Lived Experience of the Holy," (selection) p. 48-69 (in Course Packet).
- 4) Paul Koudounaris, *Heavenly Bodies: Cult Treasures and Spectacular Saints from the Catacombs*. New York: Thames & Hudson, 2013, "Holy Bodies: Relics and the Roman Catacombs," p. 23-43 (in Course Packet).

***Suggestions for Further Reading:***

- 1) R. Po-Chia Hsia, *The World of Catholic Renewal, 1540-1770*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998, "Counter Reformation Saints," p. 122-137 (on Course Reserve).
- 2) Charlene Villeseñor Black, *Creating the Cult of Saint Joseph: Art and Gender in the Spanish Empire*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006, especially "Happy Families," p. 59-87 (on Course Reserve).

*October 30, 2019:*

**Sanctity in North American: "Becoming Holy" on the Frontier**

Part and parcel of Catholic response to the Protestant Reformation of the sixteenth century was the militancy of global Catholic expansion in the centuries following. Faced with a schismatic movement that could not be reincorporated by persuasion or by force back into the bosom of the Catholic Church, Catholics "took their show on the road." If they could not reconquer a fractured Europe for Catholicism, then they would bring newly discovered parts of the globe under the Catholic aegis. This inaugurated something of a global religious "arms race," particularly in the Americas, in which Catholic and Protestant powers both sought to augment their overseas holdings and to convert the areas' original

inhabitants to their particular confessional brand of Christianity. In North America's native peoples, however, missionaries faced unprecedented (and unwelcome) theological questioning that, in their scope and radicalism, went far beyond what they had encountered in Europe.

On the Catholic side, saints played an important part in global colonisation. Colonies offered training grounds for the *formation* of saints. Canadian missionaries of both sexes (i.e. Jean de Brébeuf and Catherine de Saint-Augustin) saw and presented themselves in Counter-Reformation terms as the warriors, martyrs, and ascetics of Christ, prepared to give it all for "the greater glory of God." This model of extreme self-sacrifice was also popular with native converts of both sexes (i.e. Joseph Onaharé and Catherine "Kateri" Tekakwitha).

### **Required Readings:**

- 1) Emma Anderson, *The Death and Afterlife of the North American Martyrs*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2013, Chapter 1, "A Spectacle for Men and Angels," p. 14-53, Chapter 2, "The Blood of Martyrs is the Seed of Christians," p. 54-97 (e-resource).
- 2) Timothy Pearson, *Becoming Holy in Early Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2014, Chapter 3: "Evangelism: Indigenous Holiness," p. 62-83 (e-resource).
- 3) Nancy Shoemaker, "Kateri Tekakwitha's Tortuous Path to Sainthood," in *Negotiators of Change: Historical Perspectives on Native American Women*. New York: Routledge, 1995, p. 49-67 (e-resource).
- 4) Allan Greer, *Mohawk Saint: Catherine Tekakwitha and the Jesuits*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2005, Chapter 6, "Catherine and her Sisters," p. 125-146 (e-resource).

### **Suggestions for Further Reading:**

- 1) Kay Koppedraayer, "The Making of the First Iroquois Virgin: Early Jesuit Biographies of the Blessed Kateri Tekakwitha," in *Ethnohistory*, 40:2, Spring 1993 (e-resource).
- 2) Allan Greer, "Colonial Saints: Gender, Race and Hagiography in New France," *William and Mary Quarterly*, April 2000, Vol. 57 (2), p. 323-348 (e-resource).
- 3) Emma Anderson, "Thine Own by Adoption:" Conversion, Integration, and Fictive Kinship in the Life of Thérèse Oionhaton, Seventeenth-Century Wendat Convert (on course website).

November 6, 2019:

### **The Enlightenment and the French Revolution: New Challenges to (and Appropriations of) the Catholic Cult of Saints**

The deep anti-clericalism of Enlightenment thought and the reactionary rejection of the Catholic Church in France during the Revolution brought many new challenges to the concept of sanctity. Broadly, while many Enlightenment philosophers used their powers of deduction and rationality to criticize what they saw as the credulity and superstition of Catholic beliefs, these movements often proved unable to resist appropriating many of the same visual symbols and rituals as the religion they rejected in their own intellectual and political movements. The readings and lecture for this week explore this irony.

### **Required Readings:**

- 1) Raymond Jonas, *France and the Cult of the Sacred Heart: An Epic Tale for Modern Times*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000, p. 68-82 (e-resource).

- 2) Albert Saboul, "Religious Feeling and Popular Cults During the French Revolution: "Patriot Saints" and Martyrs for Liberty," in Stephen Wilson, ed., *Saints and Their Cults: Studies in Religious Sociology, Folklore, and History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983, p. 217-232 (e-resource).
- 3) Russell Shorto. *Descartes' Bones: A Skeletal History of the Conflict Between Faith and Reason*. New York: Doubleday, 2008, p. xiv-xx, 43-53, 97-113 (in Course Pack).
- 4) Susan Dunn, *The Deaths of Louis XVI: Regicide and the French Political Imagination*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994, "Louis XVI and Joan of Arc," p. 38-46 (in Course Pack).

***Suggestions for Further Reading:***

- 1) Alison Johnson. Louis XVI and the French Revolution. Jefferson, NC: McFarland and Co., 2013, especially "Final Hours and Execution," p. 196-200.
- 2) Jennifer Reid. *Louis Riel and the Creation of Modern Canada: Mythic Discourse and the Postcolonial State*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press, 2008, especially "Riel and the Canadian State," p. 187-201.

*Friday, November 9, 2019:*

Students are cordially invited to attend the **Public Lecture** of Canadian academic and writer **Prof. Randy Boyagoda** of St. Michael's College, University of Toronto, entitled "**Bad Catholics Make Good Fiction: Faith and Writing Today**" (details to follow).

*November 13, 2019:*

**Romantic Catholicism in Nineteenth-Century Europe**

The nineteenth-century witnessed the rise of the romantic, feminine, and anti-modern saint, finding its apotheosis in Saint Bernadette, the famed peasant visionary of Lourdes whose serial apparitions of the Virgin Mary had a stupendous impact on the course of Catholicism in her native France and internationally. Bernadette's cult was managed as a reaction to more than a century of rebellion against and rejection of the church, particularly during the French Revolution. During the nineteenth century, the mood in France had turned somber and staunchly conservative. The famed Montmartre church was built as a huge "reparation to the Sacred Heart of Jesus" for the nation's sins against it. Religious reparation and emotionalism was seen as a salve to the erosive reason insisted upon by Enlightenment thinkers, and the saints' pious femininity and faith a necessary corrective to the arid and rebellious masculinity of the *philosophes*. Their cults reflected the Catholic Church's defiance of modernity and its determination to fight for its own spiritual prerogatives in the face of a world apparently set on denying them. But Bernadette (and Romantic Catholicism itself) were roundly critiqued by emergent social scientists and popular writers such as Charcot, Freud, and Emile Zola, who saw in her visions and miracles merely hysteria and manipulation. Staunch Catholics condemned her critics as grossly irreverent (or even demonically inspired).

***Required Readings:***

- 1) Barbara Corrado Pope, "Immaculate and Powerful: The Marian Revival in the Nineteenth Century," in *Immaculate and Powerful: The Female in Sacred Image and Social Reality*, eds. Clarissa Atkinson, et al. Boston: Beacon Press Books, 1985, p. 173-196 (in Course Pack).
- 2) Ruth Harris, *Lourdes: Body and Spirit in the Secular Age*. New York: Penguin Books, 1999, Chapter 5, "Bernadette" 136-165 (in Course Pack).
- 3) Raymond Jonas, *France and the Cult of the Sacred Heart: An Epic Tale for Modern Times*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000, p. 9-33, 198-220 (e-resource).

4) Émile Zola. *Lourdes*. Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 2000, p. 328-365, 483-491 (in Course Pack).

**Suggestions for Further Reading:**

- 1) Gary B. Ferngren, ed., *Science and Religion: A Historical Introduction*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2002, Charles Darwin and Evolution, p. 208-231 (Course Reserve).
- 2) Ronald L. Numbers, *Science and Christianity in Pulpit and Pew*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007, “Experiencing Evolution: Psychological Responses to the Claims of Science and Religion,” p. 73-79 (e-resource).

**\*\*\*Please note that, due to the professor’s public lecture at the University of Chicago, our class on Wednesday, November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2019 will be cancelled. The makeup class will be on Wednesday, December 4, 8:30-11:30 am, Desmarais 9143\*\*\***

*November 27, 2019:*

**Saintly Suffering and the Far Right**

Catholic or Protestant, believers throughout Christian history have displayed marked ambiguity about the meaning of suffering, particularly physical suffering, in human life. In the mid-twentieth century suffering, illness, disfigurement and pain still exerted, in Robert Orsi’s words, a “dark magnetism” on the spiritual imaginations of Catholics, as is evident by their fascination with stigmatics and other holy sufferers. This section of the course explores both the theology of victimization in the lives of modern-day stigmatics and the intersection of Catholicism (particularly sanctity) with politics (particularly of the right wing) in France (via the ultra-conservative, nativist appropriation of Joan of Arc), Nazi Germany (by the ambivalent alternative provided by subversive stigmatic Therese Neumann) and Cold War North America (by exploring anti-Communism in the cult of the Canadian Martyrs and the apocalyptic Marian apparitions in Wisconsin).

**Required Readings:**

- 1) Bonnie Wheeler and Charles T. Wood, eds. *Fresh Verdicts on Joan of Arc*. New York: Garland Publishing, 1996, “The Joan Phenomenon and the French Right” by Nadia Margolis, p. 265-282 (e-resource).
- 2) Michael E. O’Sullivan, *Disruptive Power: Catholic Women, Miracles and Politics in Modern Germany, 1918-1965*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2018, Chapter Five, “Disruptive Potential: Catholic Miracles under the Third Reich,” p. 140-173 (e-resource).
- 3) Emma Anderson, *The Death and Afterlife of the North American Martyrs*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2013, Chapter 4, “For Canada and For God,” p. 165-213 (e-resource).
- 4) Sandra Zimdars-Swartz, *Encountering Mary: Visions of Mary from La Salette to Medjugorje*. New York: Avon Books, 1991, “History as Conspiracy: Necedah and its Later Developments,” p. 259-270 (in Course Pack).

**Suggestions for Further Reading:**

- 1) Paula Kane, “She Offered Herself Up:” The Victim Soul and Victim Spirituality in Catholicism” in *Church History*, Vol. 71, #80, March 2002 (e-resource, also on Course Website).
- 2) Sergio Luzzatto. *Padre Pio: Miracles and Politics in a Secular Age*. New York: Picador, 2011 (on Course Reserve).
- 3) Paula M. Kane, *Sister Thorn and Catholic Mysticism in Modern America*. Chapel Hill: UNC Press, 2013 (e-resource).

4) Robert Orsi, *Between Heaven and Earth: The Religious Worlds People Make and the Scholars who Study Them*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005, especially “Mildred, Is It Fun to be a Cripple?: The Culture of Suffering in Mid-Twentieth Century American Catholicism,” p. 19-47 and “Two Aspects of One Life: Saint Gemma Galgani and my Grandmother in the Wound between devotion and history, the Natural and the Supernatural,” p. 110-145 (on Course Reserve).

*December 4, 2019:*

### **Once and Future Saints**

This concluding class of the semester takes as its special focus the birth of new and future saints-in-embryo by looking at four very different case studies, exploring the causa of Rose Prince, a mid-20<sup>th</sup> century Indigenous woman whose alleged incorruption led her to her perception as a great saint by both her Carrier people and the Catholic hierarchy (though for different reasons), the radical new appropriation of Mary Magdalene as a feminist foremother and incarnation of holy feminine energies by neopagans and Goddess-worshippers, the elevation of Columbine shooting victims Cassie Bernall and Rachel Scott to the status of latter-day martyrs, and the rise of popular devotion to the Bony Lady, skeleton saint Santa Muerte, particularly in the American Southwest, Mexico, and Central and South America. **Please note that there is no Response Paper due today, but your Research Paper is due today.**

### **Required Readings:**

- 1) Emma Anderson, “Residential School Saint: The Life, Death, and Turbulent Afterlife of Rose Prince of the Carrier Nation” (this reading is available on the Course Website).
- 2) Anna Fedele, “From Christian Religion to Feminist Spirituality: Mary Magdalene Pilgrimage to La Sainte-Baume, France,” in *Culture and Religion*, Vol. 10, #3, November 2009, p. 343-361 (e-resource, also on the Course Website).
- 3) Elizabeth Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory: Early Christian Culture Making*. New York, Columbia University Press, 2004, “Religion as a Chain of Memory: Cassie Bernall of Columbine High and the American Legacy of Early Christian Martyrdom,” p. 172-196 (in Course Pack).
- 4) R. Andrew Chestnut, *Devoted to Death: Santa Muerte, the Skeleton Saint*. Oxford University Press, 2018, “Introduction: The Blue Candle,” p. 1-25 (the 2012 version is available as a e-resource, the second edition (2018) is available in hard copy on Course Reserve).

### **Suggestions for Further Reading:**

- 1) Kathleen Sprows Cummings, *A Saint of Our Own: How the Quest for a Holy Hero Helped Catholics Become American*. Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press, 2019 (especially the Epilogue, Course Reserve).
- 2) Anna Fedele, *Looking for Mary Magdalene: Alternative Pilgrimage and Ritual Creativity at Catholic Shrines in France*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013 (e-resource).
- 3) Kathleen Holscher, “Serra was No Saint: Public Catholicism in the Imperial Past and Present,” Presentation at the Annual General Meeting of the *American Academy of Religion*, November 2015 (on the Course Website).
- 4) Allan Greer. *Mohawk Saint: Catherine Tekakwitha and the Jesuits*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2005, Epilogue, “Our Catherine,” p. 193-205 (e-resource).